Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

Foot-Loose and Fancy-Free: Song and Dance as Representations of Gender and Sexuality in Shakespeare's Fairy Plays Christopher SIMONS

Shakespeare's two fairy plays, A Midsummer Night's Dream and The Tempest, present different representations of how fairies and humans occupy the same dramatic and topographical spaces, either in competition or cooperation. The songs and dances of the fairies by themselves, or with humans, can serve various dramatic ends including deception, seduction, diplomacy, celebration, and protection. In both plays, fairy or human passions can initiate or disrupt this dance (with consequences for the natural and political worlds) or defer it. Fairy song, dance, and spectacle thus bear directly on representations of gender and sexuality in these plays.

This paper reads the language of fairy song, dance, and spectacle in Shakespeare in the context of early modern constructions of gender and sexuality. The paper demonstrates how images and language of fairy song and dance challenge or subvert Elizabethan and Jacobean gender and sexual norms in both plays by undermining patriarchal authority and hetero-normative sexual behaviour. However, the paper concludes that these subversions do not reflect substantial critiques of patriarchy in the plays: both plays end with the restoration of patriarchal authority, reflecting their early modern historical and social contexts. Interpretations of both plays through contemporary performance can unsettle the return from fairyland to the normative world.

Background: Fairy Lore, Gender, and Sexuality

The historical methodology of this paper reads fairies as sixteenth- and seventeenth-century literary constructions, adapted from British and Celtic folkore. These constructions allowed drama to respond to shifts in early modern gender roles, class structures, and state and church power. As Regina Buccola writes,

Fairies were stock characters for a time on the early modern stage.... these 'airy nothings' actually provided an outlet for a wide array of social tensions and pressures along with competing notions of how best to address them. Fairies were imaginative creations dreamed up in response to and as a release from the stresses of life in a rapidly changing world. (Buccola, 2006, p. 21)

Growing up in rural Warwickshire, Shakespeare would have had plenty of opportunity to become versed in fairy lore. As Buccola points out, the line of inheritance for such lore was strongly gendered; popular culture was usually passed on by female family members. Buccola reminds us that 'Shakespeare's mother grew up on a farm in Wilmcote, his wife on a farm in Shottery' (Buccola, 2006, p. 30). Shakespeare's fairies and spirits not only share the metamorphic qualities of the actors who portray them, but also draw their representation from an oral tradition dominated by female memory and female voices. This matriarchal or female-dominated tradition was frequently sidelined, or completely ignored, by fairy tale literary theory until the last two decades of the twentieth century (Bottigheimer, 2009; Lundell, 1990; Rowe, 1979; Stone, 1986, 2008; Tatar, 2003; Zipes, 2000, pp. 189–91).

The extant written record of early fairy lore in Britain stems from the late sixteenth to mid-seventeenth century. Ironically, knowledge of fairy lore was popularised through texts written to condemn fairy belief. Concomitantly, fairy lore became associated with the superstitions of Catholicism in the written record, even though Catholicism condemned pagan superstition in popular culture. A few key sources are worth mentioning. In 1584, Reginald Scot inadvertently became an authority on fairy lore for modern scholars, with his detailed descriptions of fairies. His list mentions

giants, imps, calcars, conjurors, nymphes, changelings, *Incubus*, Robin good-fellowe, the spoorne, the mare, the man in the oke, the Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

hell waine, the fierdrake, the puckle, Tom thombe, hob gobblin, Tom tumbler, boneles and such other bugs. (Scot, 1584, p. fol. 86)

Shortly before ascending to the English throne, King James I (then James VI of Scotland) published his *Daemonologie*, which presents a rather confused discussion of four types of spirits, including faeries (1597). This work followed his pamphlet *News from Scotland*, in which James asserts not only his beliefs in magic and witchcraft, but also the belief that he was personally being targeted by a coven of witches, in league with Satan (1591). Fiercely Protestant, James promulgated witch-hunting and the widespread persecution of magic; his antipathy towards English mathematician and magician John Dee may have led to Shakespeare using him as his model for banished Prospero (Dee, 1604). James' fear of magic and witchcraft doubtless influenced the differences between Shakespeare's Elizabethan and Jacobean fairy plays—the former including *A Midsummer Night's Dream* and *The Merry Wives of Windsor*; the latter including *Macbeth, Pericles*, and *The Tempest*.

Other authors make similar accusations connecting fairies and Catholicism. Samuel Harsenet rails equally against fairy and Catholic superstitions in *A Declaration of egregious Popish Impostures* (Harsenet, 1603). Harsenet's book was published in the same year as the London edition of James' *Daemonologie* (King James I of England, 1603). Harsenet lists (cribbing from Scot) 'bull-beggers, spirits, witches, urchins, Elves, hags, fairies,' and several dozen other such monsters; he goes on to lament the 'dosen of auemaries [ave marias]' and 'halfe a dosen *Pater nosters*,' required to dispel fear of such creatures, piling superstition on superstition (Harsenet, 1603, pp. 134–5). Robert Burton's *Anatomy of Melancholy* (1621) follows the Protestant tradition of classifying fairies as evil spirits, among the 'sublunary Devils' (Burton, 1621). Finally, towards the end of the century, Robert Kirk, an itinerant minister from Scotland, became an authority on fairy lore with the publication of his *Secret Commonwealth* (Kirk, 1691).

Kirk's book demonstrates an interesting relationship between fairies and gender, in terms of gender performativity and social custom. Kirk's fairies have

Children, Nurses, Mariages, Deaths, and Burialls, in appearance, even as we, (unles they so do for a Mock-show, or to prognosticate some such things among us.). (Kirk, 1691, p. 3)

As Buccola points out, in this description, fairies become 'one imaginative means humans use to explore alternative lifestyle choices, domestic arrangements, and modes of conduct' (Buccola, 2006, p. 32). Similarly, representations of fairies in literature and popular culture could be used to explore and question hierarchies of social class and gender. Kirk notes that fairies 'are said to have aristocraticall Rulers and Laws'; Buccola adds that 'in virtually every sixteenth and seventeenth-century account of mortal visits to fairyland, the aristocratic ruler is a queen' (Buccola, 2006, p. 32).

These fairy disruptions in normative gender roles suggest the important relationships between fairy lore, gender, and social development in early modern Britain. Fairies were represented as liminal creatures, existing in the permeable borderlands between the human world and fairyland. This topological liminality also connected them to temporal and social liminalities.¹ Diane Purkiss notes how early modern fairies were often encountered at temporal boundaries, such as 'at midday, at midnight, at the change of the year, on the eve of a feast, on Hallowe'en or May Eve, in a festive space marked out from normal life, like Yule' (Purkiss, 2000, p. 86). Humans were particularly vulnerable to fairy influence during key transitions including birth, death, marriage, and childbirth (Buccola, 2006, p. 43). Jenkins describes how Irish fairies were held responsible for disruptions in family life by kidnapping people and returning them years later, after they were given up for dead; he documents 'regular references to wives returning only to find their husbands remarried' (Jenkins, 1991, p. 317). Fairy lore thus had strong associations with the liminal boundary of the marriage

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

ceremony, both as a blessing and a curse.

Fairy liminality could be used to interrogate all sorts of social roles and hierarchical relationships in early modern drama. But given the connections between social status and gender, fairy lore and literature served as key mechanisms to challenge and subvert gender and sexual norms. Susan Amussen concludes that gender power relations became unstable in early modern England as women in wealthier gentry households withdrew from work, while women in labouring households became increasingly dependent on wages as agricultural reforms took hold (Amussen, 1988, pp. 187–8). Theodora Jankowski argues that despite a patriarchal social structure and strict gender norms, the rapid economic and social development of the early modern period meant that 'attitudes towards women were... flexible,' especially in literary and dramatic contexts (Jankowski, 1992). Mendelson and Crawford observe that women in medieval and early modern England were themselves liminal beings, in terms of their habitation of, and possession of, domestic spaces including the threshold of the home. Therefore women, and the fairies that they described in their tales, often focused on their mutual roles as guardians of the home, and potential troublemakers within it (Buccola, 2006, p. 43; Mendelson & Crawford, 1998, p. 208). Ann Skjelbred notes how gender liminality reflected social imbalances in early modern England, and how Christian and folklore rituals served as sites of representation for these imbalances (Skjelbred, 1991).

If fairy texts represent instabilities and shifts in early modern attitudes towards gender and sexuality, then how do these texts represent fairy gender and sexuality? Alaric Hall documents the shift in representations of the gender of elves (the ancestors of the British fairies) in Anglo-Saxon literature. He observes that the Old Norse tradition describes only male elves (*alfar*) and concludes that the later presence of beautiful female elves reflects changes 'during the Anglo-Saxon period' (Hall, 2007, p. 76). Hall postulates that the shift in elf-gender may have occurred due to the reputation of elves as beautiful, seductive creatures.²

One interesting effect of this shift may have impacted representations of

gender and sexual ambiguities of the early modern British fairies. Hall describes how elves (*aelfe*) were 'paradigms of seductive, female beauty' by 'at least the ninth century', and that these elves were characterised more as 'otherworldly' rather than 'monstrous', despite 'demonising representations' in *Beowulf* and the Royal Prayerbook. Linguistically, however, the female denotation of the word *aelf* did not appear until the eleventh century. This might demonstrate a radical shift in elf/fairy gender between pagan and Christian Anglo-Saxon culture. Yet Hall concludes that a more likely explanation is that male Anglo-Saxon *aelfe* 'were in some significant respects effeminate', and that the male denotation could be used to gloss examples of beauty and seductiveness in either gender, such as female nymphs (Hall, 2007, pp. 94–5). This linguistic conundrum offers a fascinating basis for the gender roles and sexuality of early modern fairies.

Defining the word 'fairy' proves a complex problem in itself; it is, as Noel Williams writes, a 'name that refers to nothing'. The ephemerality of the name embodies the ephemerality of fairies as a diverse set of phenomena (Williams, 1991, pp. 457, 458, 472). However, despite this ephemerality, Williams notes that medieval belief was not a confusion of elves and fairies, but a progression from the former to the latter. The cause for this was, as in Hall's evaluation, more a matter of literature and linguistics rather than religion and overt social change; 'fairy' was a fashionable word, and the French term *fée* provided more potential for rhyme and alliteration than the word *elf*. Fairies in medieval and early modern literature could thus be synonymous with elves, pixies, pucks, and goblins (Williams, 1991, pp. 469, 471).

The semantic volatility of the word 'fairy' mirrored the volatile behaviour of fairies in lore and literature, perhaps as symbolic of the inherent volatility in nature and human life. David Young assesses the behaviour of Shakespeare's fairies in *A Midsummer Night's Dream* as paradoxically, 'a vision of inconstancy, but a coherent one, something, as Hippolyta reminds us, of great constancy' (Young, 1966, pp. 159–60). This tension in fairy behaviour between consistency and inconsistency particularly applied to gender and sexual roles; the

「お伽噺」 その過度と転回・シェンタースセクシュアリティス比較文字」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

permanence in human life of concepts such as work, home, and love is bound up with the transience of beliefs as to who is responsible for, or dominant in, the various interpretations of these concepts, and in what ways. As Buccola summarises:

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

The gender ambiguity of the fairies is manifested in part by the fact that their conduct does not serve as a clear index to their gender.... Even when gendered (by virtue of names [i.e., Titania] or personal pronouns), fairies indiscriminately engage in activities socially ascribed to men or women specifically. Fairies are most often associated with domestic and agricultural work, but 'male' sprites are as likely to be found in the pantry with the butter as in the barn with the plow. Fairy gender identities were... highly ambiguous, but fairies were most often imagined engaging in tasks ascribed specifically to women in the early modern era... (Buccola, 2006, pp. 40-1)

Shakespeare's texts bear out this description. The anonymous fairy who first appears onstage with Puck in *A Midsummer Night's Dream* describes Puck's behaviour as a list of household pranks that frustrate, rather than aid, domestic labour. However, Puck serves as Oberon's faithful servant, and at the end of the play appears with a broom, suggesting that the restoration of order includes a restoration of Puck's traditional role as a domestic helper.³ As Buccola puts it succinctly, 'Clearly the inhabitants of fairyland had no difficulty with a male maid' (Buccola, 2006, p. 42). Nor, apparently, did late-sixteenth-century theatre audiences—provided the role was wrapped in the fantasy of fairyland.

Finally, as this paper focuses on fairy song and dance—play rather than work—let us look at fairy gender and sexuality in these contexts. Fairy lore as represented on the early modern stage shared the social liminality of the theatre. The London theatres could only exist by operating in the 'liberties' outside of the legal and moral jurisdiction of the City and London: first in Shoreditch, and

later in 'the Clink' (the north-eastern part of Southwark) (Kermode, 2004; Ordish, 1971; Rowse, 1988, pp. 44, 148–50; Shapiro, 2005). Furthermore, just as the plays of Marlowe, Shakespeare, Jonson and their contemporaries had to appeal to a broad range of social classes, so the fairy lore that they represented also crossed class boundaries. As Wendy Wall writes,

Fairy belief was not the province of one specific social group.... As an institution catering to multiple social groups, the London stage presents a particularly interesting site for looking at how fairy discourse was taken up by different constituencies in early modern England. (Wall, 2002, pp. 105–6)

Shakespeare's audience for A Midsummer Night's Dream would have included people from all social classes, including agricultural labourers, traders and merchants, and aristocrats. It would also have included liminal but populous social groups including prostitutes and thieves. All of these individuals would bring to a fairy play their own experiences of gender and sexual roles; they would also bring their experiences of the forms of social play specific to their social classes, including song and dance. The audiences for performances of *The Tempest* at the Blackfriars Theatre would have been more limited in range of social class, but still with some variation in their knowledge of popular culture and their forms of song and dance.

Fairies on the stage resembled the actors that represented them, in their ability to change their appearance, their gender roles, and their personalities. Both of the fairy plays examined in this paper exhibit the motif of theatricality and performance; *A Midsummer Night's Dream* contains a play-within-a-play, while *The Tempest* (like Pericles, another late romance with fairy elements) contains a masque. Both of these performances relate to the liminal state of the marriage ceremony, an attraction for early modern fairies as described above. The rude mechanicals perform their play in act 5 of *A Midsummer Night's*

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

Dream as an entertainment at the wedding feast of Theseus and Hippolyta; the fairy masque ordered by Prospero in act 4 of *The Tempest* serves as a pagan solemnization of the future marriage of Miranda and Ferdinand.

As A. L. Rowse argues, the language devoted to discussing acting and playwriting in Shakespeare's plays shows their author's concern for realism (Rowse, 1988, pp. 34–8). This concern may seem to run contrary to the idea of fairies in drama; however, the fairy plays draw a clear connection between a sensibility for fairy magic and dramatic sensitivity. As Theseus says, in kind criticism of the mechanicals' performances: 'The best in this kind [meaning actors] are but shadows'; Puck's epilogue similarly begins, 'If we shadows have offended...' conflating the fairies and the actors who represent them (5.1.209–10, 417). The mercurial, metamorphic theatricality of early modern fairies served as a flexible mechanism through which to explore not only human life in drama, but how this life was represented on the stage.

And of all the variety of human life represented on the early modern stage, few themes were as sure to hold audiences' attention as love and sexuality. This paper examines fairy song and dance as representations of gender and sexuality in Shakespeare; as such, the fairy social interactions in his play are both sexually expressive in themselves, and also symbolic of human sexual interactions. Kevin Pask examines the shifts from the 'startling frankness' of eroticism in *A Midsummer Night's Dream* to the more 'grotesque and fantastic' eroticism of *The Tempest*, noting the 'increasingly internalised, and sometimes demonized, mystery' of sex in the latter, centred in the character of Caliban (Pask, 2013, pp. 10, 9).

We can add one important point, in light of the gender ambiguities of elves and fairies as described above. Ambiguities in fairy gender, and flexibility in fairy gender roles in the context of domestic and agricultural labour, do not always equate with effeminacy or sexual ambiguity in early modern fairies. Quite the contrary: whether overtly female or male, medieval and early modern fairies share a preoccupation with sex and seduction, particularly the seduction of

humans. Ronald Hutton describes one feature in the classification of medieval and early modern fairy lore as:

a belief in beautiful supernatural women, who dance in secluded areas at night, and who can be wooed or abducted by mortal men, but who almost always eventually forsake the resulting marriage for their own realm. Sometimes this fairy-lover motif takes the form of a man having sex with an apparent woman, only to find her turn into a monster. (Hutton, 2014, pp. 1138–9)

This aspect of fairy behaviour appears strongly in *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, in which the jealousy of Oberon and Titania stems from each accusing the other of loving their mortal counterpart in the play (Queen Hippolyta and King Theseus) as well as past dalliances with other mortals.

Hutton's classification focuses on female fairy lovers; overtly male fairies express similarly strong sexual attractions and jealousies in Shakespeare's plays. Robin Goodfellow does not have his own romance story in the play, but is frequently associated with sexuality and sexual behaviour. Depictions of Puck in the popular culture of Shakespeare's time demonstrate that male sexuality was a central component of his character. While Puck's good works included helping with domestic and agricultural chores (hence his broom or flail, and a candlestick to work by), his traditional appearance did not have the effeminacy of a male maid. The frontispiece of the chapbook Robin Good-Fellow, His Mad Pranks and Merry Jests depicts the sprite as a goat-legged creature resembling a classical satyr, 'wearing animal skins and headgear (antlers, animal ears, etc.) that invoke festive rituals' (Karim-Cooper, n.d.; Robin Good-Fellow, 1639). In further parallel to the satyr's classical role, this Robin Goodfellow also sports an erect phallus. Similarly, a broadside ballad of the same period represents Robin Goodfellow as the 'Green Man' or wild man of the woods, a monster from rural English folklore who could be benevolent or hostile. In this image, the playful spirit also sports a 「お伽噺 その遺産と転回:ジェンダー×セクシュアリティ×比較文学」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

large, if less prominent, phallus. These early modern texts show the rural origins of fairy lore; poetry and drama working in a courtly tradition appropriated this lore into a new hierarchy and new images that reflected the Elizabethan aristocracy. Yet as C. L. Barber and other critics have demonstrated, rural custom, ritual, and folklore retained a significant presence in Shakespeare, despite their incorporation into a courtly literary tradition (Barber, 1959, pp. 3–35; Laroque, 1991, pp. 3–73; "Carnival and Lent," n.d.).

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

The gender-ambivalent fairies of *A Midsummer Night's Dream* demonstrate sexual inclinations and sexual potency similar to their predecessors in rural folklore. Many of the pranks played by Shakespeare's fairies are sexual in nature; these pranks also have a tradition in medieval fairy literature. One category of good demons or spirits discussed by Gervase of Tilbury are the 'Folletos', who speak in human voices and play pranks (Gervase of Tilbury, 2002; Mueller, 1989, p. 235). Mueller compares these to the 'laughable' demons, or ioculares, described by William of Auvergne, which did not harm sleepers but pestered them by 'stripping off their bedclothes', and specialised in 'lewd exhibitionism' (Mueller, 1989, pp. 235–6).

Finally, related the contexts of sex and gender, fairy lore in early modern literature can be read as the struggle to represent a wide range of political, social, and economic instabilities. As Marjorie Swann summarises:

English fairylore was traditionally bound up with normative concepts of a precapitalist social formation; thus, as England shifted from a rural, household-based mode of production to an urban, commercial, and increasingly mercantile economy, fairylore became a particularly apt vehicle for mystifying the profound socioeconomic changes of the early modern period. Shakespeare's revision of fairylore... embodied a new awareness of this social and economic turmoil, and Stuart writers in turn recognized and exploited the ideological charge of Shakespeare's miniaturized fairy world. (Swann, 2000, p. 451)

In these shifting ideological contexts of fairy lore and literature, let us examine the gender and sexual implications of fairy song and dance in one early and one late Shakespeare fairy play: A Midsummer Night's Dream and The Tempest.

A Midsummer Night's Dream: a dance denied

In A Midsummer Night's Dream, parallel sexual and political divisions between fairies and humans present alternative narratives of female resistance to male imposition of normative gender roles. The ongoing war between Titania and Oberon, the fairy queen and king, contrasts with the placid relationship between Theseus, duke of Athens, and his bride-to-be, the warrior queen Hippolyta. The text shies away from showing division between human authority figures who could be read as allegories for people in Elizabeth's court—at the risk of the play being banned by Edmund Tilney, the master of revels from 1578.⁴ Instead, the text uses the fairy kingdom to comment on, and work through, the jealousies and sexual tensions in heterosexual relationships. The actors playing Titania and Oberon often double as Hippolyta and Theseus, with symbolic significance, as these two couples never appear on stage together.⁵

Significantly for the appropriation of rural fairy lore into courtly literature, the play begins at court, and holds off introducing the fairy world until act 2, scene 1. An unnamed fairy—often represented as female, although all characters were played by male actors on the Elizabethan stage—discusses the conflict between Titania and Oberon with Robin Goodfellow (Puck), Oberon's page or henchman. Titania and Oberon are quarrelling over the possession of a changeling, an 'Indian boy', who figures little in the plot of the play, apart from providing a cause for the quarrel. The unnamed fairy introduces the familiar idea of the fairy round, or circle, or orb: circular patterns made on grass, believed to be caused by fairies dancing in a ring.⁶ The unnamed fairy says, or sings:

Thorough flood, thorough fire, I do wander everywhere,

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

Swifter than the moon's sphere; And I serve the Fairy Queen, To dew her orbs upon the green. (2.1.5–9)

In contrast to the courtly language of Act 1, this fairy speaks in rhyming tetrameter lines; Shakespeare uses this poetic form to indicate songs, but also magic. The fairy's language can also read as erotic depending on production and performance; the last line above can be delivered either with delightful innocence or a charged sexuality.

The conversation between the unnamed fairy and Puck reveals that the quarrel between Titania and Oberon has a topographical dimension. Fairy dancing occurs in the physical space of the 'real' world—the domain of nature and rural human life. A gender war means not only no dancing, but a political, territorial dispute. The fairy monarchs share the territory of the forest grove and its fairy rings, but their antipathy means they do not wish to cross paths. As Puck recounts:

The king doth keep his revels here to-night: Take heed the queen come not within his sight; For Oberon is passing fell and wrath...

And now they never meet in grove or green,
By fountain clear, or spangled starlight sheen,
But, they do square, that all their elves for fear
Creep into acorn-cups and hide them there. (2.1.18–20, 28–31)

Puck speaks in pentameter lines, more reminiscent of the iambic pentameter reserved for courtly characters; but these pentameter lines are rhymed, creating a poetic bridge between the human and fairy courts. In these lines, the verb 'square', meaning to fight (as in the modern phrase, 'square off') uses a

geometrical image to express human relations. The word evokes the square of some courtly and country dances, and the lines and shapes of dance movement.⁷ But it also creates an oppositional geometry, in linguistic and symbolic terms, to the sexual and gender freedoms of the fairy circle or round.

Modern stagings can represent Shakespeare's fairies as gender- and sexambivalent, drawing both on the contexts of fairy myth and folklore, and the performance history of fairies on the English stage.⁸ Shakespeare's fairies were represented by child actors, with the exception of major parts such as Puck and Ariel, which may have been acted by older prepubescent males, or even adults (Shakespeare, 1980, 1984, p. 69n). The unnamed fairy who addresses Puck as a 'lob of spirits'—a lob being a large or ungraceful figure—may be playfully pointing to the size and age of the actor; the line may even suggest that Puck was played by an adult (Shakespeare, 1984, p. 2.1.16n).

Despite this flexibility, the main division in the fairy war falls along sex-lines, opposing hetero-normative male and female fairies. Titania and her train of followers—whether male or female—exhibit female gender tropes. The text suggests that Titania's possessiveness towards the Indian Boy stems from her loyalty to the boy's dead mother, and Titania's own motherly protectiveness. In contrast, Oberon's desire for the boy, to make him a 'Knight of his train, to trace the forests wild' shows some ostentatious motivation (to exhibit the boy among his followers) and pederastic desire (2.1.25). Nevertheless, Oberon's verbalised sexual jealousy is limited to heterosexual relationships; he accuses Titania of a dalliance with Theseus, an accusation that she calls 'the forgeries of jealousy' (2.1.81).

The motif of fairy dance receives some detailed description in this scene. Titania describes how Oberon's anger has disrupted the dance of festivity, sexual equality, and peace performed by Titania and her fairies:

...never since the middle summer's spring Met we on hill, in dale, forest, or mead, "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

By paved fountain or by rushy brook,
Or in the beached margent of the sea
To dance our ringlets to the whistling wind,
But with thy brawls thou hast disturb'd our sport. (2.1.82-7)

These lines again imply that the fairy dance is feminine (even if the participants include male elves) through its opposition to the masculine 'brawls' of Oberon's disruptions. Oberon's fairies, presumably both male and female, presumably can dance, but they have not been (and do not until the end of the play, when harmony is restored), whereas Titania's fairies continue to dance during the feud between the two fairy bands. These lines thus make a sexually progressive, but normative, statement: fighting and war are male behaviours; dancing and peace are female. (The statement is progressive in that it does not represent the wife, in this particular domestic conflict, as either shrewish, or at fault.) This sexual division is not surprising in terms of rural fairy lore, but it does not keep pace with the transposition of fairy literature from country to court as described above; one of the purposes of chivalric and romance literature was to acclimatise males to courtly culture, including fashion, music, and dance.⁹

The text also implies that this gender-normative behaviour has dire consequences for nature. The fairy war is disturbing the seasons and destroying agriculture. Titania continues:

...the winds, piping to us in vain,
As in revenge have suck'd up from the sea
Contagious fogs; which, falling in the land,
Hath every pelting river made so proud
That they have overborne their continents.
The ox hath therefore stretch'd his yoke in vain,
The ploughman lost his sweat, and the green corn
Hath rotted ere his youth attain'd a beard... (2.1.88–95)

Notably, these lines, though spoken by Titania, represent agriculture as male, despite many agricultural tasks depending on female work (and, in fairy lore, fairy assistance). Suzanne Hull's long list of women's domestic duties in early modern England includes many in the liminal space between house (inside) and agriculture (outside), including 'brewing, distilling, cheese- and buttermaking, care of barnyard animals... [and] kitchen gardening' (Hull, 1996, p. 57). Buccola compares this list with Latham's description of Puck's favourite chores, including such liminal household-agricultural chores as grinding mustard and malt, drawing water, breaking hemp, and bolting and dressing flax (Latham, 1972, pp. 245–6).

The last three lines, quoted above, each give one image from English agriculture; each is undeniably male, yet complex in its representation of gender. The ox is a bovine male, but gelded for agricultural work, i.e. de-sexed, and not sexually active. The ploughman has 'lost his sweat'—a by-product of masculinity and male work—and has therefore been rendered effeminate by inaction. Finally, the personified corn 'Hath rotted ere his youth attain'd a beard'; the male youth has died before achieving sexual maturity. This image ('rotted') also suggests the curse of syphilitic infection, perhaps specifically applied to the prepubescent male actors working in the theatre.

If Titania's speech represents agricultural work—disrupted by the suspension of the fairy dance—as ambivalently male, then it represents the unleashed, destructive forces of nature as female. Titania adds:

...the moon, the governess of floods,
Pale in her anger, washes all the air,
That rheumatic diseases do abound.
And thorough this distemperature we see
The seasons alter: hoary-headed frosts
Fall in the fresh lap of the crimson rose;
And on old Hiems' thin and icy crown,

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

An odorous chaplet of sweet summer buds
Is, as in mockery, set; the spring, the summer,
The childing autumn, angry winter, change
Their wonted liveries; and the mazed world,
By their increase, now knows not which is which. (2.1.103–114)

These lines upset the gender-normative associations of conflict as male and peace as female, from earlier in Titania's speech. Nature, represented as the moon, a female image, causes disease, and disrupts the seasons. The male images in these lines ('hoary-headed frosts' and 'old Hiem') both represent old men; the former is lecherous but doddering (falling in the female 'fresh lap of the crimson rose'); the latter, impotent and mocked (the female flowers now sit on the head of the old man). Female lunar power exerts influence, while the male images remain passive. Finally, Titania compares the changes in the seasons, triggered by the fairy war, to changes in gender roles. Reflecting both early modern attitudes to appearance vs. reality, and the instability of gender representation on the early modern stage, a change in costume signifies a change in gender. The seasons 'change | Their wonted liveries', and 'the mazed world', like the audience, can no longer tell whether the body under the clothes is male or female.

Like the fairy round that serves as a geometric, and topographical, representation both of fairy song (singing a 'round') and fairy dance (dancing in a circle), Titania's long speech has an enticing circularity in its argument—like Young's inconstant constancy of the fairies, a circularity that also offers progression. Titania accuses Oberon and his train of male 'brawls' that disrupt the female 'sport' of song and dance. As a result of Oberon's interference, there is no fairy dancing; consequently, nature becomes angry, 'piping to us [the fairies] in vain.' In anger at this suspension, nature (represented as a female force) disrupts agriculture (represented as an ambivalently male sphere). But the ultimate effect of the lack of fairy dancing is a suspension of *human* song and

dance:

The nine-men's-morris is fill'd up with mud,
And the quaint mazes in the wanton green
For lack of tread are undistinguishable.
The human mortals want their winter cheer:
No night is now with hymn or carol blest. (2.1.98–102)

The fairy and human worlds are not only linked together by nature; they are linked by festivity, play, and sport. The 'nine-men's-morris' refers to a strategy game like chess or draughts, popular in England since the medieval or possibly Roman age. In this example the game board, 'fill'd up with mud,' refers to an outdoor game board, such as might appear on a village green. The game has no connection to English morris dancing, but the game board metaphorically resembles the patterns of a square-form dance; similarly, the movement of the 'men' (game pieces) back and forth to form 'mills' (straight lines) resembles dancing. Furthermore, in Celtic culture, the game board seems to have had traditional associations with magic and the warding off of evil spirits; in this case, the image ironically strengthens the benevolent symbolism of British fairies in a speech that demonstrates the destructive power of their jealousy (Mohr, 1997, pp. 30–2).

The next two images in these lines explicitly refer to dance and song. The 'quaint mazes in the wanton green' describe the patterns (some perhaps similar to the outdoor nine men's morris board) pressed into the village green by dancing feet; the green is 'wanton' both because of its verdancy, and because festive rituals such as dance served as principle sites for early modern courtship in both rural and courtly life. Finally, the last image describes how the suspension of fairy dance has silenced human song—notably, religious songs ('hymn or carol') associated with Christmas.¹¹ Shakespeare's fairies, despite their pagan names, have positive associations with Christianity; these are not the fairies

described by Kirk who vanish when they hear the name of God or Christ (Kirk, 1691, p. 7).

Hence the circularity of the fairy quarrel: the lack of fairy dancing causes, through nature, a lack of human dancing. Reading these images of song and dance in the contexts of gender and sexuality, it seems clear that the fairy battle of the sexes disrupts not only nature but also human festivity and sexuality. This battle of the sexes is, on the surface, a heteronormative conflict between male violence and female festivity and placation; however, the language of the fairies can subvert the early modern expectations of normative female and male behaviour in both the fairy and human worlds. Despite the bluntness of Titania's accusations against Oberon (his brawling interrupts her dancing) she strikes a conciliating note by acknowledging her part in the feud:

...this same progeny of evil comes From our debate, from our dissension. (2.1.115–6)

Although the fairies cannot reproduce sexually the way humans do, they have 'progeny' in this context; their offspring is chaos in nature and disruption in human gender and sexual relations. These lines serve as an example of the fairies not only imitating human rituals (as described by Kirk), but creating a dark opposite; fairy love does not produce progeny as heterosexual human love can, but fairy hate produces a progeny in nature, a 'progeny of evil'.

Both fairy monarchs express sexual jealousy, but Titania, with heteronormative female grace (though again, without the shrewishness of many female heroines in early Shakespeare comedies) extends an olive branch, inviting Oberon to rejoin the fairy dance. She offers two alternatives courses for reconciliation; neither directly resolves the dispute, but both avoid conflict:

If you will patiently dance in our round

And see our moonlight revels, go with us:

If not, shun me, and I will spare your haunts. (2.1.140–2)

The former reconciliation involves dance, either through participation, or spectation; the latter describes zones of exclusive territory. In the latter alternative, the reader might presume that Titania and her fairy band will continue their own dances, placating the violence of the moon and female nature. As much as this diplomacy may feminize Titania, it also represents the empowerment of diplomatic skill. Titania's offer to Oberon suggests Elizabeth I's diplomatic manoeuvring in Europe.

Oberon refuses both alternatives. The text makes it clear that he is in the wrong in the dispute: the Indian Boy rightfully 'belongs' to Titania, both legally and morally. This is the only onstage verbal exchange between fairy king and queen until act 4, scene 1, the climax of the fairy action. Similarly, despite the many verbal references to dancing in 2.1, no fairy dance actually occurs in the play until the last scenes (4.1 and 5.1). Although these dances represent the reconciliation between Oberon and Titania's fairy bands, Titania speaks or sings only four lines in 5.1, compared to 20 by Puck and 28 by Oberon. Following the human weddings, peace has been restored in fairyland, but only at the expense of the fairy gueen's earlier voice and authority. She does not mention the Indian Boy, whom Oberon has claimed from her after using magic to humiliate her sexually. Still, Titania's role throughout the play exhibits more agency than her human counterpart; the Amazonian queen Hippolyta rarely opposes Theseus, and the actor playing her role must resort to non-verbal expressions of disagreement with the sexual inequalities in the human world of the play.¹² From the Restoration, some productions cut Hippolyta's role entirely, such as Henry Purcell's operatic adaptation of the play as *The Faerie Queene* (1692) (Shakespeare, 1984, p. 13).

Fairy Song: An Ineffective Lullaby

Oberon's revenge against his wife provides the action for the fairy story in the

「お伽噺」での過産と転回・ジェンタースセクシュアリティス比較文字」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

play.¹³ As we will see the human magician Prospero do in *The Tempest*, Oberon uses his magic to imprison Titania within the Athenian woods:

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

Well, go thy way. Thou shalt not from this grove Till I torment thee for this injury. (2.1.146–7)

Shakespeare's idea of fairy magic does not extend equal power to female and male characters alike. The only song in the play before act 5, scene 1 (unless Oberon or Puck's tetrameter spells are set to music) is the lullaby sung by Titania's fairies. This lullaby seems to cast a magical spell of protection around Titania and her followers. However, the spell is completely ineffective. Oberon intrudes on the bedroom of Titania's bower without so much as a stage direction suggesting a challenge by her fairy 'sentinel' (2.2.32).

The twentieth-century poet W. H. Auden notes, in his essay 'Shakespeare and Music', the peculiarity of the Iullaby as a musical form:

The oddest example of music with an extramusical purpose is the lullaby. The immediate effect of the rocking rhythm and the melody is to fix the baby's attention upon an ordered pattern so that it forgets the distractions of arbitrary noises, but its final intention is to make the baby fall asleep, that is to say, to hear nothing at all. (Auden, 1963, pp. 504–5)

This irony works strongly in *A Midsummer Night's Dream* act 2, scene 2, with implications for gender roles and sexual power.

Titania orders her fairies to sing her a lullaby ('Sing me now asleep'). In an inversion of parent and child roles, the older child or adult actor is sung into feigned sleep by young child actors playing fairies. The song begins:

You spotted snakes with double tongue, Thorny hedgehogs, be not seen. Newts and blind-worms, do no wrong,
Come not near our Fairy Queen.
Philomel, with melody
Sing in our sweet lullaby;
Lulla, lulla, lullaby; lulla, lulla, lullaby.
Never harm,
Nor spell nor charm,
Come our lovely lady nigh;
So, good night, with lullaby. (2.2.9–19)

The lullaby is effective in Auden's sense of the term, in that it makes Titania fall asleep. On the other hand, it is completely ineffective as a fairy 'roundel'—a charm or spell—because Oberon immediately enters the bower and drugs Titania with a potion that will 'make her full of hateful fantasies' (2.1.258). Titania will wake and fall in love with the first living animal or 'vile thing' she sees (2.2.40). The song's mythic allusion to Philomela, a woman transformed (according to Ovid's version of the myth) into a nightingale after her rape by her sister's husband, ominously foreshadows Titania's loss of her sexual will—a form of rape—imposed by Oberon's potion (Carroll, 1985, pp. 171–2).¹⁴

Thus in A Midsummer Night's Dream we can read the references to fairy song and dance as both reinforcing and subverting early modern gender roles and relations. The play's fairies may exhibit instabilities of sex, gender identity, and sexual orientation in the context of the actors playing these roles, drawing on both early modern fairy lore and interpretive freedom within Shakespeare's text. However, despite the possible subversive readings of normative Elizabethan gender roles and sexuality, this play of circa 1596 precedes many of Shakespeare's more nuanced representations of female power. The play hints at the freedom and empowerment of fairy dance and song, but rarely performs it. Similarly, the play offers a fairy war of the sexes as a symbolic alternative to the strict gender and sexual codes of the early modern world, and a celebration of

a female monarch as England's own 'Fairy Queen'. Yet the play fails to live up to its promise of any true subversion, by restoring hetero-normative relations and patriarchal authority at its denouement. Any representation of deeper gender and sexual equality in the play relies on creative interpretation of the text in modern performances.

The Tempest

In contrast to the relatively early *A Midsummer Night's Dream* (1596), *The Tempest* is widely considered to be Shakespeare's last single-author play, composed around 1610–11 (Shakespeare, 2013, pp. 2–3). The magical beings in the play are referred to as spirits, rather than fairies, reflecting the increased severity with which James I and Jacobean Protestants and Puritans viewed fairy lore as dabbling with devils, and an ally of Catholic superstition and subversion (Harsenet, 1603; 1591, 1597).

In *The Tempest*, fairy song, dance, and spectacle seem to operate as extensions of Prospero's power, i.e. the patriarchal imposition of normative gender roles on both male and female characters. Yet as in *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, gender and sexual ambiguities in the language of fairy song and spectacle subvert early modern sexual norms, and with them Prospero's authority. Furthermore, The Tempest, as a more overtly patriarchal play, surprisingly achieves what *A Midsummer Night's Dream* does not, by multiplying gender ambiguities in its characters throughout the play.

Ariel, the only named spirit or sprite in the play, frequently sings as he carries out the orders of his master, the human magician Prospero.¹⁵ Ariel serves Prospero mostly willingly, on the grounds that he will be given his freedom after one final day of service; this is the day on which the play's action is set. Ariel helps Prospero defeat his enemies: Alonso, the King of Naples, and Antonio, Prospero's brother, who usurped Prospero from the dukedom of Milan and stranded him on an almost deserted, magical island. The play is filled with music and dance. Ariel sings four songs, and plays on a tabor and pipe; these songs may be associated

with dance. He also changes his appearance several times. The play contains a masque of spirits in act 4 scene 1, which includes a dance. Prospero and Ariel also pursue their enemies in a fairy 'hunt', in which other transformed spirits appear as hunting dogs.

Ariel's Songs

In the contexts of magic, gender, and sexuality, textual ambiguities raise two questions about Ariel's songs: (a) whether his songs are actually spells, that is, *necessary*, in the play's magical context, in order to produce their effects, and (b) whether Ariel sings because he is so ordered by Prospero, or from his own free will.

Regarding the first question: in A Midsummer Night's Dream, the tetrameter poetry of Oberon's and Puck's magical spells could be represented either as speech or music. In contrast, in *The Tempest*, Ariel sings four songs, written as such.¹⁶ The role of the spirit 'must have originally been performed by an adept musician,' who could not only sing enchantingly, but play on the tabor and the pipe, as indicated in stage directions at 3.2.124 (Shakespeare, 1999, p. 18). The King's Company or King's Men, the company of players in which Shakespeare had a share since 1603, likely performed *The Tempest* at both the outdoor Globe Theatre (in summer) and at the indoor Blackfriars Theatre (in winter). The smaller Blackfriars was designed with a space for 'a small orchestra'—perhaps more musicians than those that performed standing on the balconies of the Globe and other outdoor theatres (Shakespeare, 1999, p. 9). As an indoor theatre, the Blackfriars would have had better acoustics for soft music; Vaughan & Vaughan note that 'an organ could have added [to] the island's eerie music.' The Tempest is not only a musically demanding play, but, as Peter Seng notes, frequently calls for hidden or 'dispersed' music, 'performed as if it came from all over the stage' (Seng, 1967, p. 252). But whether Ariel's songs are magical spells, or merely selfamusement as he goes about his magical work, depends on their interpretation during performance.

「お伽噺 その遺産と転回:ジェンダー×セクシュアリティ×比較文学」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

The second question in particular bears on representations of gender and sexuality in the play. It seems likely that Ariel sings simply because he feels like singing. As Auden notes:

Men [and women] use their vocal cords for speech, that is, to communicate with each other, but also, under certain conditions, a man [or woman] may feel, as we say, 'like singing.' This impulse has little, if anything, to do with communication or with other people. (Auden, 1963, p. 505)

This is one of Ariel's most human qualities in the play, and in this way vocal music plays a role in developing Prospero's recognition of his own humanity, and Ariel's, in act 5, scene 1.

The freedom of Ariel's songs, juxtaposed against his enforced service to Prospero, also emphasises the theme of freedom *versus* authority in the play. A fundamental aspect of Prospero's patriarchy is his desire for control—not only over his daughter's love and marriage, but over everything on 'his' island, including the life of his slave, Caliban. The tension between Prospero's patriarchal magic, based on his Italian books and wooden staff, and Ariel's more wild 'natural' magic, resembles the artistic tension between instrumental music and vocal improvisation. Auden describes the distinction of expression (even a battle of authority) between instrumental and vocal music as unique in the arts:

None of the other arts seem suited to... immediate self-expression. A few poets may compose verses in their bath—I have never heard of anyone trying to paint in his bath—but almost everyone, at some time or other, has sung in his bath. In no other art can one see so clearly a distinction, even a rivalry, between the desire for pattern and the desire for personal utterance, as is disclosed by the difference between instrumental and vocal music. (Auden, 1963, p. 505)

Thus, contrasts between 'instrumental' and 'improvised' or 'free' magic in the play may parallel contrasts between instrumental and sung music in the play, representing contrasts between controlling authority and individual freedom.

In turn, these tensions between freedom and control may represent contrasting expressions of gender and sexuality in the play. Again, Auden suggests a link between the subversion of the authority of the patterns and rhythms of instrumental music by vocal music, and sexuality:

To me, vocal music plays the part in music that the human nude plays in painting. In both there is an essential erotic element which is always in danger of being corrupted for sexual ends but need not be and, without this element of the erotic which the human voice and the nude have contributed, both arts would be a little lifeless. (Auden, 1963, pp. 505–6)

If this link exists in *The Tempest*, then we may expect to find expressions in Ariel's songs that subvert Prospero's will and authority, despite the influence that Ariel exerts over other characters as extensions of Prospero's power.

Ariel's Songs and Music

Gender-ambiguous language and images exist in a number of Ariel's songs. We can also find evidence of sexual ambiguity and resistance not only in Ariel's singing, but in his appearance, and even in his silence.

In the first case, song and appearance are related. At Prospero's command, Ariel transforms into an invisible 'nymph o' th' sea' (1.2.302). In this shape, Ariel and his fellow spirits calm the tempest that began the play (Long, 1961, p. 99). Developing the harmony and tension between instrumental and vocal expression discussed above, Ariel enters 'playing and singing', a stage direction which Stephen Orgel interprets as Ariel playing on a lute (Shakespeare, 1986, p. 121). The nymph-spirits' language, while not specifically female, is gentle at first:

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

Come unto these yellow sands,
And then take hands;
Curtsied when you have, and kissed
The wild waves whist... (1.2.376–9)

'Curtsied' here suggests an expression of 'courtesy', and not specifically the female gesture (equivalent of a male bow), although the song implies that the spirits serving Ariel may either be all female sea-nymphs, or androgynous spirits appearing as such.¹⁷ The archaic use of 'whist' in the fourth line, defined as 'silent' or 'hushed', opposes music and silence; the purpose of the fairies' song is to create silence in nature. The sexuality of the first four lines is not particularly gendered, but carries the sense that courteous, romantic, and sexual expression is associated with silence; the fairies' kisses and physical 'courtesies'—either to each other, or to the 'wild waves'—by implication silence the storm (Shakespeare, 1999, p. 177).

The second stanza of the song brings in pastoral imagery, specifically male: the spirits sing a 'burden' or chorus that includes the noises of dogs barking and cocks crowing, 'The strain of strutting chanticleer' (1.2.386). Both animals are not only male, but also tropes of masculinity and male aggressiveness: 'watch dogs' (guard dogs) and roosters (known both for 'strutting' and for cock-fighting). Both images subvert the eeriness and sweetness ('sweet air') of the song's verse (1.2.394).

The burden, sung by the attendant spirits, and commanded by Ariel in the same way that Ariel is himself commanded by Prospero, suggests a subtle mocking of Prospero's patriarchal authority. Here Ariel is 'playing at' Prospero—giving orders to attendant spirits. But unlike Prospero, he encourages or permits discordant, rather than obedient, behaviour from the fairies under his direct command. Does this chorus express Ariel and his fairy subjects giving vent to Ariel's sense that he is Prospero's unwilling 'watch dog'? Reacting to the music, Ferdinand guesses: 'sure it waits upon | Some god o'th'island' (1.2.389–90). The

synecdoche in this line (intangible music standing for the musicians that play it) and the metaphor of courtly music ('waits upon') raises the question: who is the 'god o'th'island'? Authority and gender are both at stake in the answer. Prospero is the patriarchal 'top dog', with Ariel under him; but on the literal level, Ariel is the preternatural or supernatural being who exerts much of Prospero's magic. The attendant spirits, singing the burden, wait on sexless, gender-ambivalent Ariel, not Prospero.

A few lines later, Ariel's second song—so influential for modern poets such as T. S. Eliot and Sylvia Plath—suggests a shift back to imagery traditionally, though not explicitly, associated with female gender roles:

Full fathom five thy father lies,
Of his bones are coral made;
Those are pearls that were his eyes,
Nothing of him that doth fade
But doth suffer a sea-change
Into something rich and strange.
Sea nymphs hourly ring his knell. (1.2.397–403)

The song suggests the transformation of the King of Naples from a more male to more female creature, and his transformation from inhabitant of the court into part of nature. The king, a male figure of divine authority on Earth in the Jacobean worldview, has drowned; his body has been absorbed into a nature that is, by the end of the sixteenth century, near-infinite, full of plenitude, and full of possibilities for other forms of existence (Lovejoy, 1936, pp. 99–143; Tillyard, 1943). His bones become coral—associated both with female jewellery, and the colour of women's lips. His eyes become pearls—worn by both Jacobean men and women, but associated with Diana through her epithet Cynthia, the moongoddess. Sea-nymphs (always represented as female) lament or memorialise his transformation.

「お伽噺 その遺産と転回: ジェンダー×セクシュアリティ×比較文学」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

In contrast to the gentleness or wonder (and immortality) of metamorphosis in the song, its intended effect is deliberately cruel. Ferdinand's father King Alonso is alive; Ariel sings to convince Ferdinand that Alonso has drowned. Is the song cruel by Prospero's orders, or is it an expression of the darker side of Ariel's imitation of human nature? The audience does not hear Prospero's commands to Ariel regarding Ferdinand:

PROSPERO Fine apparition, my quaint Ariel.

Hark, in thine ear.

ARIEL My lord, it shall be done. Exit. (1.2.318–9)

Ariel's next appearance allows us to surmise that Prospero has ordered him to fetch Ferdinand from some other part of the island, and lead him, by music or music-magic, to somewhere close to Prospero's cell: 'Enter FERDINAND and ARIEL, invisible, playing and singing' (1.2.376 stage direction). Here lies another decision for directors, regarding the magic in the play: is Ferdinand literally enchanted, or merely enchanted by the music, and following it out of curiosity and despair?

More specifically, in the context of fairy magic and fairy lore: is the Ferdinand-enchanting song a spell that must take this specific form? In other words, has Prospero ordered Ariel to torment Ferdinand? The answer influences how the text represents patriarchal authority and masculinity. The imagery of the song tells the prince that his father, King Alonso of Naples, has drowned in the tempest—a deliberate deception. The audience might assume that Prospero whispered two orders to Ariel at 1.2.318: (1) to bring Ferdinand to Prospero's cell; and (2) to make Ferdinand believe that his father is dead, or even drive him to despair at this belief. Given the harsh, tragicomic psychology underlying many characters' decision-making in the play (Prospero, Caliban, Antonio, Sebastian, Stephano), I presume that Ariel is following an explicit command by Prospero—to convince Ferdinand of the falsehood that his father has drowned.

The alternative—making the content of the song/spell Ariel's decision—gives his character more agency, but dispenses with the need for him to express his own anti-patriarchal character through subversive language.

In a second example, Ariel's music implies an imagined appearance of a particular gender. In act 3, scene 2, Ariel does not sing, but plays music to mislead the conspiracy of clowns who plan to help Caliban murder Prospero. As in his two songs in 1.2, Ariel is invisible—in stage terms, wearing a particular costume that the audience understands represents invisibility. But in 3.2, he may be untransformed—that is, not representing a 'nymph o'th' sea'—and presumably dressed as 'himself' apart from a garment denoting invisibility. In either case, Ariel is gendered by the three men who hear his magical music. The stage directions read: 'Ariel plays the tune [of the 'catch' or song] on a tabor and pipe' (3.2.124). The clowns respond:

TRINCULO This is the tune of our catch, played by the picture of Nobody.

STEPHANO If thou be'est a man, show thyself in thy likeness. If thou be'est a devil, take't as thou list. (3.2.126–9)

They offer two possible classifications for Ariel: man or devil. But ironically the phrase 'picture of Nobody' suggests a genderless body, all head and limbs; Frank Kermode detects an allusion to an image like this on the title page of the comedy *No-body and Some-body* (1606) (Shakespeare, 1954, pp. 83–4, 1999, p. 232). The related word 'nothing' in Shakespeare's comedies also has strong associations with a vernacular derogatory expression for female genitalia, i.e. 'no-thing' (Mahood, 1957). While the clowns can only imagine a male spirit, their language unconsciously describes a spirit closer to Ariel's gender—androgynous ('no-body' in the context of sexual organs) or female (sexually defined by possession of a 'no-thing').²² This is thus another example of how the text both reinforces and subverts normative gender expectations through language. The

「お伽噺 その遺産と転回:ジェンダー×セクシュアリティ×比較文学」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

buffoonish male clowns can only conceive of the invisible musician as male; however, their fear of nothingness having a voice can effectively suggest a fear of female agency, or a fear of non-binary gender roles. This passage can be used to represent gender bias and male fear of female sexuality. But it can also be used progressively, to represent the male clowns as outmoded and outclassed by modern gender and sexual identities.

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

A third and final example again relates Ariel's appearance and vocal expressions, but the music and dance *follow* his performance, rather than serve as media for it. In act 3, scene 3, Ariel inverts his magical trickery from act 3, scene 2. He appears visibly, transformed into a harpy, to torment Alonso and his followers. In this scene, although Ariel is visible to Prospero's Italian enemies for the first time in the play, his performance excludes music. Ariel does not sing, but speaks in blank verse. 'Thunder and lightning', not music, introduce his appearance (3.3.52 stage directions).²³ The harpy, an implicitly female monster, threatens the men with madness and hunger, in an allusion to the harpies of Virgil's *Aeneid*.²⁴

Unlike the sea-nymph, we do not explicitly see Prospero order Ariel to take this female form. However, the text implies that he does so. The stage directions at the beginning of 3.3 indicate that he watches the harpy's attack on the men ('on the top (invisible)', i.e. on the balcony above the stage); afterwards, he praises Ariel for his performance:

Bravely the figure of this harpy hast thou Performed my Ariel; a grace it had, devouring. Of my instruction hast thou nothing bated In what thou hadst to say. (3.3.83–6)

The last two lines above indicate that Prospero, like a playwright, has given Ariel specific commands as to what to say; he has put the words in Ariel's mouth. But these lines specifically refer to Ariel's harpy speech, rather than his appearance:

the accusations against Alonso and Antonio for their crimes, and the first mention of Prospero's name to them.

There are two possibilities here. Firstly, Ariel's transformation into a harpy—a specifically female monster—is implicitly ordered by Prospero, just as he explicitly ordered Ariel to transform into a sea-nymph in 1.2. This interpretation says something about Prospero's patriarchal—and peculiar—ideas of femaleness, in the gender context of an old man stranded on an island with his teenage daughter (mother presumed dead), and the son of a witch.

Alternatively, Prospero orders Ariel's transformation into a sea-nymph but not into a harpy. In the former case (1.2) he dictates Ariel's appearance (female) but not the substance of his songs; in the latter case he dictates the song (the substance of Ariel's of Ariel's accusations against Prospero's enemies, if not the exact words), but not Ariel's appearance. In this latter case, the language of Ariel's accusations against Prospero's enemies has a certain degree of freedom to it, and Ariel draws on his own transformed appearance for one image:

The elements

Of whom your swords are tempered may as well Wound the loud winds, or with bemocked-at stabs Kill the still-closing waters, as diminish *One dowl that's in my plume*. (3.3.61–5, my emphasis)

Both possibilities call for further exploration of Auden's point about song and instrumental music in Shakespeare. (Auden's essay does not substantively address *The Tempest*.) Ariel's freedom to express himself through song, dance, and physical transformations, while serving as an instrument of Prospero's authority, allow ambiguities of gender and sexuality to enter the play.

As in *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, the end of *The Tempest* shows the restoration of order—the triumph of patriarchal authority and normative gender roles. Prospero's forgiveness of his political enemies at the end of the play uses

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

the language and forms of fairy dance—the magic circle, and the sacred grove or green—but without the performance of dance itself. The text actually deploys images of magic or festive circles against tradition: to stop human movement and silence human voices. Ariel leads Prospero's enemies into a magic circle where they stand 'spell-stopped' (5.1.61).²⁵ As in *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, the suspension of dance signifies a break in universal order; however, Prospero creates a magic circle or roundel in order to restore political and family harmony. The fact that this 'dance' contains no movement (and magically *prevents* movement) makes a final comment on Prospero's need, like Oberon's, to retain his patriarchal authority, even going so far as to control the physical freedom of the visitors to his island, turning them into human chess pieces.

Fairy Dance

Both A Midsummer Night's Dream and The Tempest are plays filled with magical or fairy song and dance; the texts use these forms of expression to explore, and subvert, normative gender roles. However, in general, dance is deferred until the end of both plays: until the last scenes of A Midsummer Night's Dream (4.1 and 5.1), and the marriage masque in The Tempest (4.1).

The magical or fairy dances in both plays suggest that, in the context of gender and sexual roles, they represent the inverse of song. The fairy round, the fairy masque, and the magic circle represent the restoration of authority, patriarchy, and normative gender roles. In *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, Titania orders a 'roundel and a fairy song' in 2.2, but the dual purpose of this dance is as a lullaby, and a spell of protection. It is defensive, outward-facing, and proves ineffective.

The true restoration of fairy dance occurs at the end of the play; it restores not only harmony but patriarchy. Titania and Oberon dance with Puck (and presumably fairies from both trains) in the forest in 4.1; Oberon expresses himself affectionately, but not apologetically or contritely: 'Now thou and I are new in amity' (4.1.84). Titania, unsurprisingly, does not seem to be herself after

her experience with Bottom. She follows Oberon's command without question, calling for fairy music to charm Bottom and the four lovers. After the dance, she has the last lines before she exits with Oberon and Puck:

Come, my lord, and in our flight
Tell me how it came this night
That I sleeping here was found
With these mortals on the ground. (4.1.96–9)

Foakes suggests that this dance 'marks the renewal of love and harmony between Oberon and Titania'; Wells similarly notes that the dance 'marks a turning-point in the action' (Shakespeare, 1980, 1984, p. 116n). The actor playing Titania might deliver these lines with good humour, but the lines more strongly suggest a tone of bewilderment and disorientation. The language of Oberon's last flower-spell to clear Titania's eyes—'Be as thou was wont to be'—seems to have been only partially effective.

The final dance occurs in the house of Theseus and Hippolyta in Athens, after the three pairs of newlyweds have gone to bed. Oberon introduces the song that directs the fairies to dance. Titania speaks only four lines:

First rehearse your song by rote,
To each word a warbling note;
Hand in hand with fairy grace
Will we sing and bless this place. (5.1.375–8)

From a gender perspective, these lines exemplify Auden's argument about control and freedom in musical expression. Titania's words demonstrate that the fairy song and dance will not be improvised or inspired, but learned and rehearsed 'by rote'. The fairy queen's freedom of expression has been reduced to less than the early modern labourer's wife or daughter; in this instance, Titania

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

and her fairies cannot sing or hum to themselves as they go about their work. Furthermore, each word of the song must have its 'warbling note'; the song can contain no words that are not set to music. This is an explicit contrast to the more free-form music without words in *The Tempest*: the animal- and bell-sounds of the fairies singing the burden to Ariel's songs in 1.2.

After Titania's meagre lines, Oberon resumes the song.²⁶ Its message, delivered as the festive song to bless the play's three marriages, reinforces early modern sexual norms:

To the best bride-bed will we. Which by us shall blessèd be; And the issue there create Ever shall be fortunate. So shall all the couples three Ever true in loving be... (5.1.381–6)

The play uses the fairy world to explore gender and sexual tensions between three human couples; but this fairy dance aligns with the function of the early modern marriage ceremony. Oberon commands the fairies to bless the marriage beds, using 'field-dew' as a substitute for holy water (5.1.393). The fairy song blesses heterosexual marriage, and, moreover, sexual reproduction as the purpose of marriage. Furthermore, it reinforces the hierarchical structure of the human world (a hierarchy understood by, and respected by, the fairies); Oberon and Titania will go to bless 'the best bride-bed', that is, Theseus and Hippolyta's.²⁷ Fairy dance thus to some degree functions at odds with fairy song earlier in the play. A Midsummer Night's Dream uses celebratory dance (and accompanying song) in its conventional early modern role: to represent festivity and reconciliation through marriage at the end of a comedy, and to conclude the action as it moves from 'the town to the grove' and back again (Barber, 1959, p. 119).

Just as fairy dance in *A Midsummer Night's Dream* is often mentioned but rarely performed, so in *The Tempest*, song and dance have separate functions. A masque, including song and dance, takes place in act 4, scene 1, to celebrate the future marriage of Miranda and Ferdinand. The *'graceful dance'* of nymphs and reapers at the end of the masque is carefully orchestrated; only the spirits or fairies, rather than any principal characters, participate (4.1.138 stage directions). The dance is also carefully chaperoned: the observers are observed. After Prospero warns Ferdinand of the dire consequences of premarital sex, he watches the young couple like a hawk, as *they* watch a dance of male harvest reapers (fairies representing humans) and female nymphs (fairies representing classical spirits or demi-gods).

Fairy subversion of gender and sexuality can enter the text here, as the dancers are all spirits, Ariel's 'corollaries'. Like Ariel, they have no clear gender, although Prospero masculinizes them by calling them 'fellows' (4.1.35).²⁸ On the Jacobean stage they would have been played by male actors, probably boys. But the principal characters in the masque and dance are female: the Greek goddesses Iris, Ceres (usually played by the actor playing Ariel), and Juno (4.1.167). Prospero celebrates his daughter's imminent dynastic marriage to the prince of Naples by ordering a fairy masque that celebrates female spiritual authority. This can be represented progressively on the modern stage as Prospero's acknowledgment of Miranda's present or future independence as queen of Milan and Naples. Conversely, the text in its early modern context suggests a patriarchal appropriation and ordering of the female divinities of peace (Iris), fertility (Ceres), and leadership (Juno).

As a final interesting note: in *A Midsummer Night's Dream*, the fairy dance celebrates only the human world (and human marriage), not fairy reconciliation. We never see Titania and Oberon 'kiss and make up' on equal terms. Oberon describes his plan to release Titania from his spell, but still take what he wants: 'I'll to my Queen and beg her Indian boy; | And then I will her charmèd eye release | From monster's view, and all things shall be peace' (3.2.375–7). In the next scene,

お伽噺 その遺産と転回:ジェンダー×セクシュアリティ×比較文学」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

he tells Puck that he has carried out this plan, although the audience never see it:

When I had at my pleasure taunted her,
And she in mild terms begged my patience,
I then did ask of her her changeling child,
Which straight she gave me, and her fairy sent
To bear him to my bower in Fairyland.
And now I have the boy, I will undo
This hateful imperfection of her eyes. (4.1.54–60)

The fairy king thus exerts his authority over his queen, in an act of injustice. This is a double stain on his character: first, he takes what is not rightfully his; secondly, he takes it through magic and manipulation, forcing Titania to bend to his will while she is under the influence of a mind-altering substance. Did Shakespeare not write this conversation because he could not find a way to represent it without irreparably tarnishing Oberon's authority?

The dance at the end of *A Midsummer Night's Dream* is observed by the audience, but not by the principal characters: they have all gone to bed. Similarly, in *The Tempest*, the world of spirits serves the human world: Prospero's authority commands the fairy masque. Their song and dance blesses the coming marriage, but does not bring about, or symbolise, political resolution in the play. Quite the contrary: Prospero is so immersed in the fairy spectacle he ordered that he forgets the threat against his life, the imminent attack on his cell by Caliban and the clowns Stephano and Trinculo.²⁹ Prospero 'starts suddenly', and his remembered anger, or sudden loss of concentration, dispels the magical dance: the spirits 'to a strange hollow and confused noise... heavily vanish' (4.1.138 stage directions).

Prospero excuses his anger to Miranda and Ferdinand with the graceful speech beginning, 'Our revels now are ended' (4.1.148). If patterned musical performance reflects Prospero's patriarchal authority in the play, then the old magician's absorption in the fairy performance suggests his vulnerability to

a suspension or disruption of this authority through music and dance. This is how the text capably reflects the Dionysian effects of song and dance on patriarchy. Despite its careful orchestration and instrumentation, the fairy masque commanded by Prospero suspends his authority and anger. When he remembers himself, and the conspiracy against him, his anger returns. But this anger is not directed against his enemies, but against the recognition of the mutability of his own power: 'We are such stuff | As dreams are made on, and our little life | Is rounded with a sleep' (4.1.156–8). Song and dance as rituals of social hierarchy both preserve authority and destabilise it, allowing authority to achieve a degree of self-awareness.

Nevertheless, Prospero's return to the 'real world' restores his patriarchal perspective, in which he dismisses the magical performance he commanded as 'baseless fabric' and an 'insubstantial pageant' (4.1.151, 155). Depending on the tone of its delivery, this speech might represent a growing anti-patriarchal recognition of the arbitrary nature of human existence. On the other hand, the action that follows suggests the usual restoration of order and patriarchy at the end of an early modern play, similar to the end of *A Midsummer Night's Dream*. Prospero once again resorts to violent (and in terms of imagery, masculine) magic, moments after his speech, as Ariel's corollary spirits transform into hunting hounds and run down the magician's enemies. We might thus surmise that a Jacobean performance of these lines reinforces a division between the musical patterns of feminine dance and masculine hunting—tabor, pipe and strings evoking the former, horns the latter.³⁰

Conclusion

This paper has used representations of fairy song and dance in two of Shakespeare's fairy plays to investigate how these plays subvert, or reinforce, norms of early modern gender and sexuality in England. The paper began with a summary of fairies in early modern literature, and the relationship of fairy drama to representations of gender and sexuality. The paper then argued that

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

in A Midsummer Night's Dream and The Tempest, fairy song gives female and male fairy characters opportunities to subvert gender and sexual norms, and challenge patriarchal authority, both fairy and human. The poetry spoken by Puck and the other fairies of A Midsummer Night's Dream demonstrates the liminality of fairy characters as moving between various dialectics including male and female, speech and song, court and countryside, etc. Titania's lengthy description of the fairy 'battle of the sexes' in A Midsummer Night's Dream 2.1 includes language that genders spheres including agriculture and labour, nature, and war—sometimes with surprising subversions or reversals.

Similarly, Ariel's songs in *The Tempest* open up a space for interpretation on gender and authority. Close reading of the songs raises questions about to what extent Ariel exerts Prospero's power directly, or with some degree of interpretive freedom. The language of Ariel's songs, like Titania's language of the fairy war, both deploys and subverts gender norms. Ariel's songs also raise the question of how early modern magic employed music and dance. The various spirits' transformations, language, and use of musical instruments present different possibilities regarding Prospero's control over Ariel and the island's magic. W. H. Auden's ideas regarding instrumental *vs.* vocal expression in music provide a theoretical basis for investigating the gender implications of fairy song and dance in the play.

The paper goes on to argue that fairy or magical dance in these plays should also be further investigated independently from music and song, to bring out the tensions between the two. *A Midsummer Night's Dream* frequently mentions dance as a symbol of friendship and reconciliation; however, the text calls for only two dances specifically. The former, in 2.2, is a lullaby, which, as Auden notes, serves the musical purpose of disconnection from consciousness, and from music itself. The lullaby also has the magical purpose of a spell of protection for Titania and her fairy band; as such, the 'roundel' proves completely ineffective against Oberon's aggressive, masculine penetration of Titania's bower. The final fairy dance in 5.1 represents a restoration of Oberon's patriarchal authority

over Titania, and normative Elizabethan sexuality: the blessing of heterosexual marriage as a vehicle for sexual reproduction. Neither Titania nor Hippolyta have strong voices in this dénouement; Oberon and Puck get the last words.

Similarly, in *The Tempest*, the main dance in the play (the marriage masque of 4.1) represents a carefully orchestrated performance that celebrates heterosexual marriage and fertility in the service of patriarchal political and sexual authority. Although Ariel and his spirits play the roles of female goddesses, they do not have the opportunity to use the text of the masque to subvert Prospero's authority, since he is watching the performance. However, Prospero's absorption into the play-within-the-play serves as an example of genuine psychological reaction to music and dance in a Shakespeare play. Prospero is distracted by the dance of nymphs and reapers; his coming back to the 'real world' demonstrates a change in his character and perhaps a refinement, if not a transformation, in his understanding of patriarchal authority.

Further research on this topic can begin by investigating the role of music and dance in early modern magical incantation in Britain and Europe (Tomlinson, 1993; Trucco, 2003). What roles did music play in the practice of Elizabethan and Jacobean magic? The same question can be asked of fairy lore and fairy magic: in fairy texts, what role does music and dance play in the creation of magical effects? Limitations in the number of extant early modern fairy texts can be supplemented by examples from classical myth and medieval fairy lore that may have been known to early modern writers. The results of this research should provide a more substantial context in which to examine how early modern writers used fairy song and dance, and magical song and dance in general, to represent challenges to, and subversions of, gender and sexual norms.

新 その過度と転回・シェノダースセクシュアリティス比較文字」 Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

Footnotes

- ¹ Victor Turner and Brian Sutton-Smith discuss how liminal situations in popular culture provide settings in which new symbols and paradigms arise—how these situations are the 'seedbeds of cultural creativity' (Turner, 1982, p. 28).
- ² As one example, Hall cites lines from the alliterative poem *The Wars of Alexander* (composed ca. 1350–1450) in which the word 'elfe' implies a paragon of female beauty. Alexander describes Candace, queen of Prasiaca: 'Scho was so faire & so fresche, as faucon hire semed, | An elfe out of anothire erde or ellis an aungell' [She was so beautiful and so vivacious, she seemed like a falcon, | An elfe out of another world or else an angel] (Duggan & Turville-Petre, 1989, p. 167, cited in Hall).
- As Minor White Latham argues, Shakespeare's Puck shows his connection to the lineage of English fairy lore by carrying a broomstick, the 'one item of his costume' that 'never changed' unless it alternated with a threshing flail (Latham, 1972, pp. 245–6). Latham argues that Puck's broomstick demonstrates the persistence of fairy lore in Elizabethan popular culture to the extent that it did not require overt explanation by Shakespeare in the text: 'That Robin Goodfellow survived the 16th and 17th centuries without losing his broom or his candlestick, would argue well for the universality and minuteness of the knowledge concerning him, and would furnish ample proof of his folk origin, the recollections of which continued to exist' (Latham, 1972, p. 248).
- ⁴ Tilney (1535/6 1610) was the chosen 'man of credit' sought to reform entertainment in Elizabeth's court; 'His success owed much to greater reliance on professional actors, flourishing in London's new theatres' (Dutton, 2008). Dutton summarises: 'From Tilney's arrangements with the actors at court there grew a general system of licensing plays, companies, and theatres in the London area, as reflected in Philip Henslowe's *Diary*. The relationship had a profound effect on the development of Elizabethan drama.... Tilney's censorship (evident in the extant manuscript of *Sir Thomas More*) ensured that plays would not offend important people or friendly foreign powers, and that they did not openly address matters of state or religious doctrine, but he left actors creative scope'.
- ⁵ R. A. Foakes summarises the debate about the difficulties of casting *MND*, in terms of the unusually large number of principal parts, and the Elizabethan stage convention against doubling fairy roles using adult actors (Shakespeare, 1984, pp. 3–4, 71–2n).

- ⁶ See *OED*, 'fairy ring, *n*.' Definition 1. gives the folkloric meaning: 'A ring or circle of fairies; a dance in which fairies form a circle'. Definition 2. gives the botanical meaning: 'A circular mark on the ground supposed to be a magic circle formed by fairies; *spec*. a circular band of grass differing in colour from the grass around it and caused by the growth pattern of certain fungi'. For the magical properties of the circle, see for example *OED* 'roundel, *n*.' I.1.a, 'A circle or ring drawn, marked out, or formed in some way'; this definition gives one example with a magical context, from Thomas More's *Dialogue Heresyes* (1529): 'Those nygromancers... that put theyr confydence in the roundell and cercle on the grounde.' For the fairy dance believed to be the cause of fairy rings, see *OED* 'roundel, *n*.' II.12, 'A type of round dance.' This definition cites *A Midsummer Night's Dream* 2.2.
- According to The English Dancing Master (1651), only 8 of the 105 forms described used square rather than circular movements (Playford, 1651). Neither a courtly nor a country late-sixteenth-century audience might therefore associate square movements with dancing, although such forms existed.
- For example, in the most recent Hollywood adaptation, Oberon and Puck are played respectively with gentleness and camp; neither expresses much sexual interest in either sex. In contrast, in Russell T. Davies' 2016 adaptation for the BBC, Oberon expresses a strong masculinity in contrast to the insecure, gender-oppressive masculinity of Duke Theseus, represented as a fascist dictator.
- ⁹ Medieval English texts that exhibit such courtly male behaviour, drawing on the tradition of French and Italian romance, include Sir Gawain and the Green Knight, and Chaucer's The Knight's Tale and The Squire's Tale. Shakespeare shows a good understanding of this tradition in Pericles, in which the knights of Pentapolis dance after their joust, still wearing their armour: first with each other, and then with the ladies of the court (Shakespeare, 1998, pp. 2.3.96–106).
- ¹⁰ See *The Oxford English Dictionary*, 'ox, n.' 1.a. 'a castrated adult male of this animal'.
- There is one more image associated with dancing in this list of ailments; the 'rheumatic ailments' described by Titania in I.105, caused by the wet weather, are diseases of the joints, and so an impediment to movement and dancing. Celtic fairies are associated with rheumatism; this set of ailments has long been associated with mountebank cures, such as mummia (Cook, 1906, p. 248; Mooney, 1887, pp. 141–2).

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium

"Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

- ¹² In his 2016 film adaptation of A Midsummer Night's Dream for the BBC, Russell T. Davies draws attention to, and presents a non-textual solution to, this problem, by making Hippolyta an unwilling bride to Theseus (she is literally bound for most of the play): Titania frees her in 5.1 and reveals her to be her lover, thus revealing her own sexuality as bisexual, and implying an open or polyamorous marriage with Theseus (Kitchener, 2016; Whiting, 2016).
- ¹³ Ironically, Oberon authorises the use of the fairy love potion on one of the human lovers, Demetrius, as a remedy for Demetrius' mistreatment of Helena, his past lover, and future wife. In other words, Oberon can recognise the harm of male sexual jealousy in another man, but not in himself.
- ¹⁴ Jonathan Bate discusses Shakespeare's detailed understanding of the Ovidian version of the Philomela myth (both the original, and Golding's translation) and its uses in Titus Andronicus (Bate, 1993, pp. 113-7).
- ¹⁵ Following the Arden Third editors of the play, I use the male pronoun to refer to Ariel, despite his gender ambiguity, because the single instance of a pronoun used to refer to Ariel in the play is a male pronoun, 'him' at 1.2.193, and because the role would have been performed by a young male (Shakespeare, 1999, p. 9n).
- 16 As Vaughan & Vaughan note, arrangements for two of the songs ('Full fathom five' and 'Where the Bee sucks') survive, both by Robert Johnson, a lutenist in the court of James I (Chickering, 1994; Shakespeare, 1999, p. 18).
- ¹⁷ See OED, 'curtsy | curtesy, v.' 1.a. 'To make a curtsy; to do reverence to; now, like the n., said only of women.' Lindley suggests that in the song 'at least two spirits probably echoed words from Ariel's song, either moving about the curtained music-room, or else positioned above, behind and possibly below the stage to give a stereophonic effect' (Shakespeare, 2013, p. 139n). However, this discounts the possibility of Ariel narrating (and orchestrating) a dance of sea-nymphs around Ferdinand.
- See OED, 'coral, n.' 1.a. 'Historically, and in earlier literature and folk-lore, the name belongs to the beautiful red coral, an arborescent species, found in the Red Sea and Mediterranean, prized from times of antiquity for ornamental purposes, and often classed among precious stones.' This definition cites Shakespeare's sonnet 130: 'Coral is far more red, than her lips' red' (I.2). Definition 4.b. notes the colour of red coral as a metaphor for beauty: 'Anything of bright red colour: blood, the lips, etc.' Similarly,

- definition 7.b. 'Coral-like, the colour of red coral' cites *The Taming of the Shrew*: 'Tranio, I saw her coral lips to move, | And with her breath she did perfume the air. | Sacred and sweet was all I saw in her' (Shakespeare, 1981, pp. 1.1.174–6).
- ¹⁹ Interestingly, according to the *OED*, the earliest recorded use of 'pearl, *n.1* and *adj*.' is in its non-literal sense, 'relating to the eye', or, 'The pupil or the lens of the eye.' Shakespeare's line thus points to the oldest metaphorical use of the marine gem.
- ²⁰ Shakespeare might draw directly from Golding's translation of Ovid, or Philemon Holland's translation of Pliny, for his image of a Nereid or sea-nymph; see the examples cited in *OED* 'sea-nymph, *n*.' (Pliny, 1601, p. ii. 567).
- As Vaughan & Vaughan note, at 1.2.304 Prospero hands Ariel a magical garment, 'some kind of robe or costume... that suggests a sea-nymph' (Shakespeare, 1999, p. 171n). They add that 'After this speech, the audience knows that whenever it sees Ariel in this garment, the spirit is meant to be invisible to all the characters on stage except Prospero.' Keith Sturgess suggests that this sea-nymph garment of invisibility was not the 'robe for to go invisibell' listed in the inventory of the Admiral's Men, as recorded in *Henslowe's Diary* (Henslowe, 1961, p. 325; Sturgess, n.d., p. 87). However, the inference that Ariel wears the sea-nymph costume in 3.2 seems worth questioning in a play that resembles a masque for its frequency of spectacle and costume change.
- ²² As Stephen Orgel suggests, Stephano's catch may itself include obscene references to female genitalia, if an editor lets the Folio's 'cout' stand (Shakespeare, 1986, p. 161, 1999, p. 231).
- ²³ Magical music and dance occur *after* the Ariel-harpy vanishes; see the stage directions after 3.3.82. The fairy song and dance here seem to affect the action only slightly; they primarily serve as entertainment to the audience while the spirits 'carry out the table.' The music and dance cannot influence Alonso and his company, who have gone mad; nor do they have any effect on Prospero, who is busy congratulating Ariel and relishing his revenge.
- ²⁴ Aeneas encounters the harpies, led by Celaeno, on the Strophades (Shakespeare, 1999, p. 238; Virgil, 1958, book iii. 209–77, pp. 81–3).
- ²⁵ The stage directions for 5.1.33 indicate that Prospero '*Traces a circle*'—presumably with his staff, but possibly with his hand or foot—while speaking his fairy incantation. The stage directions for 5.1.57 describe how '*They all* [Alonso, Gonzalo, Sebastian, Antonoio

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales. Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

and their attendants Adrian and Francisco] enter the circle which Prospero had made and there stand charmed...'

- ²⁶ R. A. Foakes suggests that Oberon and Titania's tetrameter lines are not the actual fairy song, and that the 'ditty' is missing; he notes that 'Shakespeare's habit is to differentiate his songs metrically, as at 2.2.9' (Shakespeare, 1984, p. 141n).
- ²⁷ The 1999 Hoffman film subverts this line by using it as a voice-over to an image of Hermia and Lysander in bed together, suggesting that theirs is the 'best bride-bed'. This suggests that of all the lover pairings in the play, this is the only one perfectly acceptable to Hollywood sexual norms, as it is not a result of magical deception (Helena and Demetrius) or war and violence (Theseus and Hippolyta).
- ²⁸ 'Fellow' could refer to female companions, associates, comrades, etc. but was used less frequently in this way. The few OED examples listed under 'fellow, n.' for women in definition 2.b. include Judges xi. 37 in the Kina James Bible, of the same period as The Tempest.
- ²⁹ This forgetfulness is another rare example of what Auden describes as a character in a Shakespeare play 'properly' listening to music: 'Further, it is rare that a character listens to a song for its own sake since, when someone listens to music properly, he forgets himself and others which, on the stage, means that he forgets all about the play. Indeed, I can only think of one case where it seems certain that a character listens to a song as a song should be listened to, instead of as a stimulus to a *petit roman* of his own, and that is in *Henry VIII*, Act III, Scene I...' (Auden, 1963, p. 513).
- ³⁰ The stage directions at 4.1.254 call for 'A noise of hunters', but do not specifically mention horns. However, the association of horns with hunting was a commonplace in poetry and on the stage; this instrumentation would have been easy to add to performances both at the Globe and the Blackfriars.

References

- Amussen, S. (1988). *An Ordered Society: Gender and Class in Early Modern England*.

 Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Auden, W. H. (1963). Music in Shakespeare. In *The Dyer's Hand* (pp. 500–527). London: Faber and Faber.
- Barber, C. L. (1959). Shakespeare's Festive Comedy: a study of dramatic form and its relation to social custom. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Bate, J. (1993). Shakespeare and Ovid. Oxford: Clarendon.
- Bottigheimer, R. B. (2009). Fairy tales: a new history. Albany, N.Y.: Excelsior.
- Buccola, R. (2006). *Fairies, fractious women, and the old faith: fairy lore in early modern British drama and culture.* Selinsgrove: Susquehanna University Press.
- Burton, R. (1621). *The anatomy of melancholy, what it is: with all the kindes, causes, symptomes, prognosticies, and seuerall cures of it.* Oxford.
- Carroll, W. C. (1985). *The metamorphoses of Shakespearean comedy*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Chickering, H. (1994). Hearing Ariel's Songs. *Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies*, 24. 131–72.
- Cook, A. S. (1906). Shakespeare, Oth. 3. 4. 74. *Modern Language Notes*, 21(8), 247–250. http://doi.org/10.2307/2917557
- Dee, J. (1604). To the Kings most excellent Maiestie. [A petition from Dee to James I, asking "to be tryed and cleared of that horrible and damnable ... Sclaunder ... that he is, or hath bin a Conjurer, or Caller, or Invocator of divels."].
- Duggan, H. N., & Turville-Petre, T. (1989). *The Wars of Alexander*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Dutton, R. (2008). Tilney, Edmund (1535/6–1610). In H. C. G. Matthew, B. Harrison, & D. Cannadine (Eds.), *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Online). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Gervase of Tilbury. (2002). *Otia imperialia: recreation for an emperor.* (S. E. Banks & J. W. Binns, Eds.). Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Hall, A. (2007). Elves in Anglo-Saxon England: Matters of Belief, Health, Gender and Identity. UK: Boydell & Brewer.
- Harsenet, S. (1603). A declaration of egregious Popish impostures to withdraw the

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

harts of her Majesties subjects from their allegeance, and from the truth of Christian religion professed in England, under the pretence of casting out devils, practised by Edmunds alias Weston, a Jesuit, and divers Romish priests his wicked associates. Whereunto are annexed the copies of the confessions and examinations, etc. [By S. H., i.e. Samuel Harsnet, Archbishop of York.]. London.

- Henslowe. (1961). *Henslowe's Diary*. (R. A. Foakes & R. T. Rickert, Eds.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hull, S. W. (1996). Women According to Men: The World of Tudor-Stuart Women. Walnut Creek, California: Altamira Press.
- Hutton, R. (2014). The Making of the Early Modern British Fairy Tradition. *The Historical Journal*, 57(4), 1135–1156. http://doi.org/10.1017/S0018246X14000351
- Jankowski, T. (1992). Women in Power in the Early Modern Drama. Chicago: University of Illinois Press.
- Jenkins, R. P. (1991). Witches and Fairies: Supernatural Aggression and Deviance Among the Irish Peasantry. In P. Narvaez (Ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland Books.
- Karim-Cooper, F. (n.d.). Fairies Re-fashioned in A Midsummer Night's Dream. Retrieved September 3, 2016, from http://www.bl.uk/shakespeare/articles/fairies-refashioned-in-a-midsummer-nights-dream
- Kermode, F. (2004). The age of Shakespeare. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.
- King James I of England. (1603). *Daemonologie* (First English edition). London: A. Hatfield for R. Waldgrave.
- King James VI of Scotland. (1591). News from Scotland. Edinburgh.
- King James VI of Scotland. (1597). *Dæmonologie, in forme of a dialogue, divided into three Bookes*. Edinburgh: R. Waldgrave.
- Kirk, R. (1691). Secret Commonwealth; or, a treatise displaying the chiefe Curiosities as they are in use among diverse of the People of Scotland to this day. Edinburgh.
- Kitchener, S. (2016, May 5). Lesbian kiss added to BBC's new A Midsummer Night's Dream "because it"s 2016'. *Express* (Online). London. Retrieved from http://search.proquest.com.libproxy.temple.edu/docview/1787006771/abstract/D314F2949A0E42FDPQ/1
- Laroque, F. (1991). Shakespeare's festive world: Elizabethan seasonal entertainment and

- the professional stage. (J. Lloyd, Trans.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Latham, M. W. (1972). *The Elizabethan fairies: the fairies of folklore and the fairies of Shakespeare*. New York: Octagon Books.
- Long, J. H. (1961). *Shakespeare's use of music: a study of the music and its performance in the original production of seven comedies*. Gainesville: University of Florida Press.
- Lovejoy, A. O. (Arthur O. (1936). *The Great Chain of Being: a study of the history of an idea*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Lundell, T. (1990). Fairy tale mothers. New York: P. Lang.
- Mahood, M. M. (1957). Shakespeare's wordplay. London: Methuen.
- Mendelson, S., & Crawford, P. (1998). *Women in Early Modern England, 1550–1720*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Mohr, M. S. (1997). *The new games treasury: More than 500 indoor and outdoor favorites with strategies, rules, and traditions.* New York: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Mooney, J. (1887). The Medical Mythology of Ireland. *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*, 24(125), 136–166.
- Mueller, T. B. (1989). *The marvellous in Gervase of Tilbury's Otia imperialia* (D.Phil thesis). University of Oxford.
- Ordish, T. F. (1971). Early London theatres: in the fields. London: White Lion Publishers Ltd.
- Pask, K. (2013). *The Fairy Way of Writing: Shakespeare to Tolkien*. Baltimore, Maryland: The Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Playford, J. (speculative). (1651). The English Dancing Master; or, plaine and easie Rules for the dancing of Country Dances, with the tune to each Dance. London.
- Pliny. (1601). *The historie of the world, commonly called the Naturall Historie of C. Plinius Secundus*. (P. Holland, Trans.) (1st ed., Vols. 1–2). London: A. Islip.
- Purkiss, D. (2000). At the Bottom of the Garden: A Dark History of Fairies, Hobgoblins, and other Troublesome Things. New York: New York University Press.
- Robin Good-Fellow, His Mad Prankes and Merry Jests. (1639). London.
- Rowe, K. E. (1979). Feminism and fairy tales. Women's Studies, 6(3), 237–257.
- Rowse, A. L. (1988). Shakespeare the man (Revised edition). Basingstoke: Macmillan.
- Scot, R. (1584). Discoverie of witchcraft (1651 ed.). London.
- Seng, P. J. (1967). *The Vocal Songs in the Plays of Shakespeare: a Critical History.* Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

- Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium
- "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"
- Shakespeare, W. (1954). The Tempest. (F. Kermode, Ed.) (Revised edition (1961)). London.
- Shakespeare, W. (1980). *A midsummer night's dream*. (S. W. Wells, Ed.) (1980 ed.). Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Shakespeare, W. (1981). *The taming of the shrew*. London: Methuen.
- Shakespeare, W. (1984). *A Midsummer Night's Dream*. (R. A. Foakes, Ed.) (2007 ed.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Shakespeare, W. (1986). The Tempest. (S. Orgel, Ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Shakespeare, W. (1998). *Pericles*. (D. D. Vecchio & A. Hammond, Eds.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Shakespeare, W. (1999). *The Tempest*. (A. T. Vaughan & V. M. Vaughan, Eds.) (Arden Third Series). London: T. Nelson.
- Shakespeare, W. (2013). *The Tempest*. (D. Lindley, Ed.) (Updated). Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Shapiro, J. S. (2005). *1599: a year in the life of William Shakespeare*. London: Faber and Faber.
- Skjelbred, A. H. B. (1991). Rites of Passage as a Meeting Place: Christianity and Fairylore in Connection with the Unclean Woman and the Unchristened Child. In P. Narvaez (Ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland Books.
- Stone, K. F. (1986). Feminist Approaches to the Interpretation of Fairy Tales. In *Fairy Tales and Society* (pp. 229–236). University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Stone, K. F. (2008). *Some day your witch will come*. Detroit, Michigan and London: Wayne State University Press.
- Sturgess, K. (n.d.). "A quaint device": The Tempest at the Blackfriars. In K. Sturgess (Ed.), Jacobean Private Theatre (pp. 73–96). London.
- Swann, M. (2000). The politics of fairylore in early modern English literature. *Renaissance Quarterly*, 53(2), 449–473.
- Tatar, M. (2003). *The hard facts of the Grimms' fairy tales* (Expanded 2nd edition). Princeton, New Jersey and Oxford: Princeton University Press.
- The Fight between Carnival and Lent. (n.d.). Retrieved October 2, 2016, from http://www.bl.uk/collection-items/the-fight-between-carnival-and-lent
- Tillyard, E. M. W. (1943). The Elizabethan World Picture. London: Chatto & Windus.
- Tomlinson, G. (1993). Music in renaissance magic: toward a historiography of others.

- Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- Trucco, D. (2003). Suono originario: musica, magia e alchimia nel Rinascimento. Dronero: L'arciere.
- Turner, V. (1982). From Ritual to Theatre: the Human Seriousness of Play. New York: Performing Arts Journal.
- Virgil. (1958). The Aeneid (Ed. W. F. Jackson Knight). London: Penguin.
- Wall, W. (2002). Staging Domesticity: Household Work and English Identity in Early Modern Drama. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Whiting, K. (2016, May 27). A Midsummer Night's Dream: Russell T. Davies hasn't "changed" Shakespeare's A Midsummer Night's Dream, but he's certainly put his own spin on it. The acclaimed boundary-pushing writer and producer tells Kate Whiting about the "method in his madness." *The Gloucestershire Echo*, p. 32. Gloucestershire.
- Williams, N. (1991). Semantics of the Word Fairy: Making Meaning Out of Thin Air. In P. Narvaez (Ed.), *The Good People: New Fairylore Essays*. New York: Garland Books.
- Young, D. P. (1966). Something of Great Constancy: the Art of "A Midsummer Night"s Dream'. New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press.
- Zipes, J. (2000). The Oxford Companion to Fairy Tales. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Invited papers: 2015 CGS Symposium "Fairy Tales, Their Legacy and Transformation: Gender, Sexuality and Comparative Literature"

自由気ままに:シェイクスピアの妖精劇における ジェンダー・セクシュアリティの表象としての歌と踊り クリストファー・サイモンズ

本稿はジェンダー・セクシュアリティの近世の解釈の文脈において、シェイ クスピアの2つの妖精劇、「夏の夜の夢」「テンペスト」における妖精の歌・踊 り・見世物の言葉を読み解くものである。本稿では、両劇における妖精の歌と 踊りのイメージと言葉が、家父長制の権威とヘテロノーマティヴな性的振舞い を掘り下げることによって、どのようにエリザベス朝とジャコビアン時代の ジェンダー・セクシュアリティ規範に異議を唱えているか、あるいは転覆させ ようとしているかを論証する。また本稿では、Regina Buccola のようなイギリ スにおける妖精の伝統の歴史と伝承についての、近年の重要な学説に着目す る。そこではアングロ-サクソン文学における"妖精"という言葉の起源から、 "妖精"という言葉の意味の中にあるジェンダーの不確かさ・多義性が探求さ れ、イギリスの妖精伝承におけるジェンダーとセクシュアリティとの関係につ いての広範な背景が提示されている。またそこでは、妖精文学が近世イングラ ンドにおける政治的・社会的・経済的なうつろいやすさ表象可能にしている か、ということについていくつかの例をあげて論評されている。「テンペスト」 においては、妖精の歌と踊りと見世物は、ジェンダーを覆うプロスペローの権 力の拡張として作用する。すなわち男性・女性という規範的な性的役割の強要 である。だがしかし、「夏の夜の夢」「テンペスト」どちらにおいても、妖精の 歌や見世物の言葉におけるジェンダーや性的なあいまいさ、多義性は、近世の 性的規範を転覆させるものである。

Keywords:

シェイクスピア、妖精、フォークロア、歌、踊り